

June 26, 2020

Commissioner Doug Elgin
Missouri Valley Conference
1818 Chouteau Ave
St. Louis, MO 63103

Dear Commissioner Elgin,

We are a consortium of advocates for women and girls in sports. Access to and participation in sports improves the lives of all students, and that is particularly true for girls and women.

During this time of COVID-19, we are writing to remind you of your institutional obligation to uphold Title IX.¹ We understand that these are trying times for collegiate institutions, including athletics departments. In response to financial pressures, we have become aware that some universities are considering program cuts to their athletic programs.² As the commissioner of the Missouri Valley Conference, we ask that you be a leader in ensuring your conference and your

¹ 20 U.S.C. §§ 1681-1688.

² Sallee, Barrett. "Group of Five Commissioners Ask NCAA to Relax Rules That Could Allow More Sports to Be Cut." CBS Sports, April 15, 2020. Available at: <https://www.cbssports.com/college-football/news/group-of-five-commissioners-ask-ncaa-to-relax-rules-that-could-allow-more-sports-to-be-cut/>. (Five Conferences—American Athletic Conference (AAC), Conference USA, Mid-American Conference (MAC), Mountain West Conference, and the Sun Belt Conference—formally requested the NCAA to lower the minimum team requirements for Division 1 membership. The NCAA subsequently denied their request.)

See also:

Hawkins, Stephen. "Slashed St. Ed's: Reeling School Cuts Teams, Breaks Hearts." ABC News. ABC News Network, May 7, 2020. Available at: <https://abcnews.go.com/Sports/wireStory/slashed-st-eds-reeling-school-cuts-teams-breaks-70563956>. (Saint Edward's University cuts six varsity teams.);

Keith, Braden. "After Cuts, Sonoma State Says It Will Add Roster Spots to Comply with Title IX." SwimSwam, May 1, 2020. Available at: <https://swimswam.com/after-cuts-sonoma-state-says-it-will-add-roster-spots-to-comply-with-title-ix/> (After cutting two women's varsity teams, Sonoma State University adds roster-spots to women's teams in an attempt to stay compliant with Title IX.);

Park, Rohnert. "SSU to Discontinue Men's and Women's Tennis and Water Polo Teams." SSU News. Sonoma State University, April 23, 2020. Available at: [http://news.sonoma.edu/article/ssu-discontinue-men's-and-women's-tennis-and-water-polo-teams](http://news.sonoma.edu/article/ssu-discontinue-men's-and-women's-tennis-and-water-polo-teams;);

Rogers, Eric, and Rick Neale. "Florida Tech Cuts Football Program, Announces Layoffs Due to Coronavirus." WKMG News 6 & Click Orlando, May 12, 2020. Available at: <https://www.clickorlando.com/news/2020/05/11/florida-tech-cuts-football-program-announces-layoffs-due-to-coronavirus/>;

Shanesy, Todd. "Cost-Cutting Changes Hit Big South Conference." Shelby Star, Gannett, May 12, 2020. Available at: <https://www.shelbystar.com/sports/20200512/cost-cutting-changes-hit-big-south-conference> (The Big South Conference limited schools to only four teams in postseason tournaments next year. Those are men's and women's soccer, women's volleyball, softball, and baseball, or three women's sports and two men's sports.)

members do not cut any athletic programs, and specifically, that they preserve women's athletic opportunities to participate and receive equal treatment. The data we have compiled from the Equity in Athletics Database demonstrates that women are facing serious Title IX deficiencies; they lag behind men's programming in every measurable criteria.³ The attached legal memo provides a thorough analysis of the data for your conference's members under Title IX.

As the Commissioner of the Missouri Valley Conference, we ask for your leadership in upholding your legal and moral obligations to women in higher education by ensuring measures are taken to protect their educational opportunities. Indeed, we sincerely hope the Missouri Valley Conference will be a leader in gender equality in athletics, in service of the larger goals of higher education.

In 1972, Congress passed Title IX, and President Nixon signed it into law. In 1975, schools were given three years, until 1978, to comply with the regulations applying the statute to athletics.⁴ In the 2018–2019 year alone, at Missouri Valley Conference member schools, in sum (refer also to table below):

- **941 females were denied a sports opportunity**, under the first test of Title IX compliance, based on unduplicated numbers.
- There are two other legal tests for whether an institution is providing enough athletic opportunities for women, and Missouri Valley Conference member institutions fail both of them as well.
- If Missouri Valley Conference member institutions were to provide women with equal opportunities to participate and add these 941 female student-athletes for the 2020–2021 school year, **an additional \$8,118,847 in scholarship aid** would need to be provided for their female student-athletes in order to equal the male student-athlete scholarships.⁵
- Moreover, Missouri Valley Conference member institutions would need to **spend an additional \$1,695,308 recruiting female athletes** to provide this type of benefit equally to male and female athletes, as required by Title IX.
- Title IX requires not just equal opportunities *quantitatively*, but *qualitatively* as well. We urge you to review whether women's sports receive equal treatment in aspects such as: facilities, equipment, scheduling, marketing, coaching, recruiting, academic and other support.
- As a reminder, these are rare and rationed educational experiences for both men and women. Missouri Valley Conference member institutions provided just 4.4% of its students with a varsity sports experience in 2018–2019 school year.
- When aggregated nationally, the discrimination we have demonstrated by the Missouri Valley Conference adds up to tragically large losses for women, losses that will never be remedied.

³ Equity in Athletics Disclosure Act, available at: <http://ope.ed.gov/athletics/>. Each year, colleges and universities provide the Department of Education with data from their athletic department regarding numbers of participation opportunities provided to the students, scholarships, staffing, and revenues and expenses, that are broken down by the men's and women's teams.

⁴ 34 C.F.R. § 106, available at: <https://www2.ed.gov/policy/rights/reg/ocr/edlite-34cfr106.html#S41>.

⁵ Letter from Dr. Mary Frances O'Shea, National Coordinator for Title IX Athletics, Office for Civil Rights, Department of Education, to Nancy S. Footer, General Counsel, Bowling Green State Univ. (July 23, 1998), available at: <https://www2.ed.gov/about/offices/list/ocr/docs/bowlgrm.html>

- Last year alone, NCAA schools provided women with 63,149 fewer sports opportunities than these schools provided men, as a raw number. However, women enroll in postsecondary education at higher rates than men, so simply subtracting the opportunities provided to women from the opportunities provided to men does not capture the true discrimination gap.
- Last year alone, NCAA colleges and universities provided women with 148,030 fewer sports opportunities than provided to men, if women and men had equal opportunities. In other words, if they both had an almost 4:100 chance of getting to play collegiate sports, women would have had an additional 148,030 sports opportunities. (Men currently enjoy a 3.93% sports participation rate, while women are provided with just a 2.36% participation rate.)
- Last year alone, women lost \$1 billion dollars in collegiate athletic scholarship aid, because they are women.

As you will see on the table below, we have assigned a pass/fail “grade” to indicate whether each school is providing equal participation opportunities, scholarship dollars, and benefits (using recruiting spending as one proxy) to its male and female students. Title IX compliance requires equality overall.

Missouri Valley Conference Institution Name	Overall Title IX Grade	Needed Additional Scholarship Dollars for Women	Grade - Equitable Scholarships	Needed Additional Sports Opportunities for Women (based on duplicated count)	Needed Additional Sports Opportunities for Women (based on unduplicated count)	Grade - Equitable Participation	Needed Additional Recruiting Dollars for Women	Grade - Equitable Benefits	Student-athletes as percent of total student body (based on unduplicated count)
Bradley University	Fail	\$ -	Pass	20	35	Fail	\$ 11,241	Fail	4.6%
Drake University	Fail	\$ -	Pass	180	159	Fail	\$ 147,252	Fail	12.9%
Illinois State University	Fail	\$ 1,425,491	Fail	111	90	Fail	\$ 201,586	Fail	2.5%
Indiana State University	Fail	\$ 1,585,060	Fail	83	77	Fail	\$ 209,591	Fail	4.9%
Loyola University Chicago	Fail	\$ 870,152	Fail	141	91	Fail	\$ 251,106	Fail	1.9%
Missouri State University-Springfield	Fail	\$ 1,552,780	Fail	49	108	Fail	\$ 410,603	Fail	2.8%
Southern Illinois University-Carbondale	Fail	\$ 997,764	Fail	20	38	Fail	\$ 37,266	Fail	4.4%
University of Evansville	Fail	\$ -	Pass	56	44	Fail	\$ 79,260	Fail	16.2%
University of Northern Iowa	Fail	\$ 1,510,601	Fail	136	124	Fail	\$ 190,902	Fail	4.6%
Valparaiso University	Fail	\$ 176,999	Fail	192	175	Fail	\$ 156,501	Fail	13.0%
Total		\$ 8,118,847		988	941		\$ 1,695,308		Average: 4.4%

Denying women equal athletic opportunities is a significant loss. The research linking sports participation with life-long educational, economic, and health benefits is well-established. Sports provide males and females from diverse socioeconomic, racial, and ethnic backgrounds measurable positive educational impacts.⁶ Betsey Stevenson, an economist now at the University of Michigan, found that playing sports actually *caused* more education and higher incomes.⁷ Girls who play sports make 8% higher wages compared to their non-sport playing counterparts.⁸ In addition, a sports experience changes a woman’s short-term and long-term health trajectory

⁶ Staurowsky, E. J., M. J. DeSousa, K. E. Miller, D. Sabo, S. Shakib, N. Theberge, and N. Williams. *Her Life Depends on It III: Sport, Physical Activity, and the Health and Well-Being of American Girls and Women*. East Meadow, NY; Women’s Sports Foundation. (May 2015).

⁷ Stevenson, Betsey. *Beyond the Classroom: Using Title IX to Measure the Return to High School Sports*. NBER Paper Series, Working Paper 15728. 2010. Available at: <http://www.nber.org/papers/w15728>.

⁸ *Id.* at 24.

including: decreased risk of heart disease, breast cancer, osteoporosis, tobacco and drug use, unwanted teen pregnancy, sexually transmitted diseases, depression and suicide.⁹ Research by Ernst and Young found that 96% of C-suite women were athletes.¹⁰

Athletics is commonly referred to as the “front porch” to the university and thereby communicates an institution’s values to the entire community. As such, athletics can lead the way toward a better environment for women on campus overall, including sexual assault prevention. Gender equality in athletics—one of the only sex-segregated areas of your member schools—demonstrates *substantively* that Missouri Valley Conference members treat men and women as equals. If the Missouri Valley Conference and its member institutions’ athletics departments do not treat women as equal to men, it cannot expect its male students to do so, either now or in the future.

The facts and the law are clear.

The Missouri Valley Conference professes to be committed to equity and inclusion. In fact, the Conference signed on to the NCAA’s Presidential Pledge to promote diversity and gender equality in intercollegiate athletics within the past four years.¹¹ Most of your peer NCAA institutions have also signed this pledge.

Now is the time to act and live up to this pledge. The COVID-19 crisis is causing serious disruption, as are other important considerations like the Black Lives Matter movement, demands to hire women and people of color, name/image/likeness rights to athletes, concussion monitoring, and gambling oversight, among others. Gender equity and compliance with Title IX must finally be part of these major revisions to college sport.

Your member schools are failing women by hundreds of participation opportunities and millions of dollars in athletic scholarships for women. As the legal memo shows, neither the NCAA’s Certification program, nor its “Institutional Performance Program” (IPP), nor its Emerging Sports Program have been effective at closing the enormous gaps for women athletes or creating diversity for employment opportunities in university athletic departments.

⁹ Staurowsky, *supra*, note 5.

¹⁰ Ernst & Young, “Global Survey Reveals Critical Role Sports Play for Female Executives in Leadership Development and Teamwork in Business,” (June 18, 2013). Available at: <https://www.prweb.com/releases/2013/6/prweb10841451.htm>.

¹¹ NCAA’s Presidential Pledge. Available at: <http://www.ncaa.org/about/resources/inclusion/ncaa-presidential-pledge>. “The Pledge and Commitment to Promoting Diversity and Gender Equity in Intercollegiate Athletics” reads in full:

“Consistent with our mission and values, our institution, a member of the National Collegiate Athletic Association, pledges to specifically commit to establishing initiatives for achieving ethnic and racial diversity, gender equity and inclusion, with a focus and emphasis on hiring practices in intercollegiate athletics, to reflect the diversity of our membership and our nation.

“We recognize and value the experiences individuals from diverse backgrounds bring to intercollegiate athletics. To that end, we will strive to identify, recruit and interview individuals from diverse backgrounds in an effort to increase their representation and retention as commissioners, athletics directors, coaches and other leaders in athletics. As part of this commitment, we will also engage in a regular diversity, inclusion and equity review to inform campus policy and diversity initiatives.

“We understand this to be a collective responsibility we owe to student-athletes, staff, our athletics programs and the entire campus community.”

Data for the entire NCAA, NAIA, NJCAA, and USCAA paints a clear picture that intentional discrimination against women is not isolated to specific conferences, competitive levels, or geographic regions. Women cannot move to another competitive tier or region to escape the discrimination. Rather, intercollegiate athletics as a whole is complicit in systematic, intentional discrimination against women. These disparities reflect thousands of separate decisions over decades to provide women less. It will not end without hundreds, if not thousands of intentional decisions to rectify the injustice of sex discrimination in intercollegiate sports.

Sending out this letter, our accompanying legal memo, and our charts is part of our broader campaign to raise awareness of intentional discrimination against women in sport across the country. As we move forward with this broader campaign, we look forward to sharing the names of the conferences and schools that are taking immediate concrete steps towards their professed values of gender equality and inclusion. We are asking you to lay out the specific steps that your conference will take to end this discrimination against women, now.

We look forward to your leadership response before July 10, 2020, just weeks after the 48th anniversary of Title IX. Please respond to this correspondence by email.

Regards,



Nancy Hogshead-Makar, J.D.
CEO, *Champion Women*



Amy Poyer, J.D.
Senior Staff Attorney, *California Women's Law Center*

Supporting Organizations:

Active Policy Solutions
Athletes Unlimited
Centre for Sport and Human Rights
Clearinghouse on Women's Issues
The Drake Group
Equal Rights Advocates
Fair Play for Girls in Sports, a project of Legal Aid at Work
The Fearless Coach
Feminist Majority Foundation
Institute for Sport and Social Justice

National Center for Lesbian Rights
National Federation of State High School Associations
Power Plays
Southwest Women's Law Center
Tucker Center for Research on Girls & Women in Sport
USA Badminton
What Equality Looks Like
Women's Law Project
Women's Rugby Coaches and Referees Association

cc: Stephen Standifird, President, Bradley University
Earl F. Martin, President, Drake University
Larry H. Dietz, President, Illinois State University
Deborah J. Curtis, President, Indiana State University
Dr. Jo Ann Rooney, President, Loyola University Chicago
Clifton M. Smart, President, Missouri State University
John M. Dunn, Interim Chancellor, Southern Illinois University at Carbondale
Christopher M. Pietruszkiewicz, President, University of Evansville
Martin A. Nook, President, University of Northern Iowa
Brian Hardin, Athletic Director, Drake University
Larry Lyons, Athletic Director, Illinois State University
Steve Watson, Athletic Director, Loyola University Chicago
Kyle Moats, Athletic Director, Missouri State University
Liz Jarnigan, Athletic Director, Southern Illinois University at Carbondale
Mark Spencer, Athletic Director, University of Evansville
David Harris, Athletic Director, University of Northern Iowa